## Contents

Preface Acknowledgments Special Notice	xix xxiii xxvii
Part One Overview of Consumer Law	1
Assignment 1: What Is Consumer Law?	1
A. Origins of Consumer Law  Carlill v. The Carbolic Smoke Ball Co.	1 2 5
Federal Trade Commission v. Airborne Health, Inc.  B. Consumer Law in the Modern Marketplace C. Consumer Law Compared to Consumer Protection	8 10
D. Fields Related to Consumer Law Problem Set 1	12 14
Assignment 2: Who Is a Consumer?	17
<ul> <li>A. Definitions of Consumer     Houston Livestock Show and Rodeo, Inc. v. Hamrick</li> <li>B. Defining a Consumer Transaction     Gallegos v. Stokes</li> <li>C. Who Is Consumer Law Trying to Protect?</li> <li>D. Special Categories of Consumers</li> <li>Problem Set 2</li> </ul>	17 19 22 23 26 27 29
Assignment 3: Who Makes Consumer Law?	32
<ul><li>A. Types of Law</li><li>1. Statutes</li><li>2. Regulations</li><li>3. Guidance/Commentary</li><li>4. Case Law</li></ul>	32 32 34 35 35
<ul><li>B. Federal Government</li><li>1. Federal Trade Commission</li><li>2. Consumer Financial Protection Bureau</li><li>3. Other Regulators</li></ul>	36 36 37 39
<ul><li>C. State and Local Government as Lawmakers</li><li>1. Attorneys General</li><li>2. State Banking Regulators</li></ul>	39 39 40
3. City Government D. Preemption	40 41

**xii** Contents

Barnett Bank of Marion County, N.A. v. Bill Nelson, Florida Insurance Commissioner, et al. Problem Set 3	41 45
Part Two Consumer Meets Business: Getting Into the Deal	49
Assignment 4: Solicitations	49
<ul> <li>A. In-Home Solicitations Pinnacle Energy, L.L.C. v. Price</li> <li>B. Telephone Solicitations <ol> <li>Telemarketing Fraud Federal Trade Commission v. Bay Area Business Council Inc.</li> <li>Do-not-call List Mainstream Marketing Services, Inc. v. Federal Trade Commission</li> <li>C. Email Solicitations</li> <li>D. Referral Schemes and Other Solicitation Techniques</li> </ol> </li> </ul>	49 50 53 53 54 58 59 65 66
Federal Trade Commission v. SkyBiz.com, Inc.	66
Problem Set 4	71
Assignment 5: Advertising	73
<ul> <li>A. Unfair and Deceptive Advertising</li> <li>1. False Advertising</li></ul>	73 73 73 77 83 84 84 85 86
	89
<ul> <li>Assignment 6: Consumer Privacy and Identity Theft</li> <li>A. The General Approach to Consumer Privacy</li></ul>	89 90 96 98 100 101 104
Assignment 7: Credit Reporting	106
A. Content of Consumer Reports  1. Types of Reports  2. Data Collected  B. Uses of Credit Reports  1. Credit  2. Insurance	106 106 107 109 109 110
3. Employment  Kelchner v. Sycamore Manor Health Center	111 112

Contents	xi	ii

	C.	Decisions Based on Reports	115
		1. Adverse Action Defined	115
		Safeco Insurance Co. of America et al. v. Burr et al.	116
		2. Duties if Adverse Action Is Taken	123
	D.	, 1 0	123
		1. Detecting Errors	123
		2. Disputing Information	126
		3. Credit Repair	128
	E.	Enforcement for FCRA Violations blem Set 7	128 129
		ignment 8: Credit Discrimination	131
			131
	A. B.	Prohibited Bases of Discrimination	131
	ь.	1. Sex or Gender	132
		Markham v. Colonial Mortgage Serv. Co.	133
		2. Race and Color	137
		3. National Origin	137
		4. Other Bases	138
	C.	Credit Process	139
		1. Applications	139
		2. Evaluations	139
		3. Data Collection	140
	D.	Proving Liability	141
		1. Disparate Treatment	142
		2. Disparate Impact	142
		Tex. Dep't of Housing and Community Affairs, et al. v.	
		The Inclusive Communities Project, Inc., et al.	142
	E.	Adverse Action and Data Collection	151
		1. General Notices	151
		2. Adverse Action Notices	152
	_	Williams v. MBNA America Bank, N.A.	153
	Pro	blem Set 8	157
Dai	rt T	hree	
		the Deal: Terms and Financing	159
<b>D</b> 0		·	
		ignment 9: Unfair or Deceptive Acts or Practices	159
	Α.	Common Law Actions	159
	В.	Federal Unfair and Deceptive Acts and Practices Laws	160
		1. Federal Trade Commission's UDAP Statute	160
	0	2. CFPB's UDAAP Statute	162
	C.	State UDAP Laws	164
	D	Rhonda Bosland v. Warnock Dodge, Inc.	165
	D.		171
		1. Landlord-Tenant Law	172
		Pierce v. Reichard	172
		2. Unauthorized Practice of Law	174 <i>174</i>
		Sussman v. Grado	1/4

xiv	Contents
ATV	Contents

3. Towing Practices	176
Waters v. Hollie	176
4. Mouse-Trapping on Internet	177
Problem Set 9	178
Assignment 10: Warranties	181
A. Uniform Commercial Code	181
1. Express Warranties	182
Sanders v. Apple Inc.	182
2. Implied Warranties	187
B. Magnuson-Moss Warranty Act	188
Smith v. LG Electronics USA, Inc.	189
C. Statutory Warranties	196
Milicevic v. Fletcher Jones Imports, LTD	197
Problem Set 10	201
Assignment 11: Usury	204
A. Historical and Comparative Contexts of Usury	204
B. State Statutes	205
Citibank (South Dakota), N.A. v. Rosemary Walker DeCristoforo	206
C. Federal Law	213
D. Usury as Economic and Social Policy	215
Problem Set 11	217
Assignment 12: Credit Cost Disclosures	218
A. Basic Concepts in Truth in Lending	218
1. The Finance Charge	219
Household Credit Servs. v. Pfenning	220
2. Amount Financed	225
3. Annual Percentage Rate	225
B. Distinguishing Closed-End Credit and Open-End Credit	226
C. Disclosure Design and Delivery	227
Smith v. Cash Store Mgmt., Inc.	228
Problem Set 12	236
Assignment 13: Home Purchases	244
A. Anatomy of a Home Purchase	245
1. Qualifying for a Mortgage	245
Horiike v. Coldwell Banker Residential Brokerage Co.	247
2. Closing on a Home	252
3. Housing Finance System	255
B. Liability for Homes	258
1. Caveat Emptor	258
Douglas v. Visser	258
2. Warranties on New Property	263
Davencourt at Pilgrims Landing Homeowners Ass'n v.	
Davencourt at Pilgrims Landing LC	264
3. Manufactured/Mobile Homes	268
Problem Set 13	269

Contents xv

Assig	nment 14: Home Mortgages	272
1	Making Mortgage Loans Underwriting the Loan (QM)	272 274
2	2. Special Rules for High-Cost Mortgages (HOEPA)	276
7	Bishop v. Quicken Loans, Inc.	276
	3. Creditor Defenses and Borrower Liability	285
	Mortgage Servicing . Payment Collection	285 286
	2. Default and Loss Mitigation	287
	Valbuena v. Ocwen Loan Servicing, LLC	289
3	B. Rescission	293
	Paatalo v. JPMorgan Chase Bank	293
Probl	em Set 14	297
Assig	nment 15: Credit Cards	299
	Credit Card Transactions	299
	imitations on Fees and Other Product Terms	301
	. Late Fees and Other Penalty Fees	301
	2. Rate Changes	303
	Defenses to Liability for Charges	304
	. Claims Against Merchants 2. Unauthorized Charges	304 305
2	Crestar Bank, N.A. v. Cheevers	305 305
D E	Payments from Consumers	310
	em Set 15	312
Assig	nment 16: Automobile Transactions	314
A. A	Automobile Sales	315
1	. Odometer Laws	315
	Owens v. Samkle Automotive Inc.	315
	2. Lemon Laws	320
	Automobile Financing	321
1	. Dealer Reserves	321
	Beaudreau v. Larry Hill Pontiac	322
	2. Loan Packing	330
	3. Leases	330
	Citle Loans em Set 16	331 333
	nment 17: Payday Loans	335
_	• •	335
	Payday Loan Industry Regulatory Approaches to Payday Loans	336
	Quik Payday, Inc. v. Stork	337
	. Disclosure Requirements	344
	2. Limits on Interest Rates and Costs	345
	B. Limits on Numbers of Transactions	345
	E. Bans on Payday Lending	346
	Policy Debates on Payday Lending	348
	. Product Substitution	348

2. Relationship of Payday Lending to Financial Distress	349
3. Regulatory Arbitrage	350
Problem Set 17	350
Assignment 18: Student Loans	353
A. Federal Student Loans	354
1. Types of Federal Student Assistance	354
2. Loan Limits, Interest Rates, Fees, and Disclosures	355
3. Postponing Repayment	357
4. Servicing	358
5. Repayment Programs	359
B. Private Student Loans	360
1. Disclosures	361 361
<ul><li>2. Repayment</li><li>C. Default</li></ul>	361
1. Collections	362
Bible v. United Student Aid Funds, Inc.	363
D. Discharging Student Loans	374
Statutory Discharge	374
2. Bankruptcy	375
E. For-Profit Schools	376
1. Scholarship Scams and Diploma Mills	376
2. Government Discharge and Reimbursement Programs	
for School Misconduct	376
3. Legal Claims	377
Problem Set 18	378
Assignment 19: Banking Transactions	380
A. Bank Accounts	380
1. Checking Accounts	381
Marx v. Whitney Nat'l Bank	383
In re Burrier	387
2. Account Disclosures	395
3. Account Access	396
B. Electronic Funds Transfer Act	397
1. Debit Cards	397
2. ACH and Bill Pay Systems	398
C. Other Payment Transactions 1. Money Orders and Remittances	399
<ol> <li>Money Orders and Remittances</li> <li>Stored Value or Prepaid Cards</li> </ol>	400 400
3. Mobile Payments	400
Problem Set 19	403
Assignment 20: Online Transactions	405
A. Contracting Online	405
Fteja v. Facebook, Inc.	406
B. Shopping Online	412
C. Marketing Online	414

Conten	Contents	
	Digital Applications In re Apple In-App Purchase Litig. Oblem Set 20	416 <i>417</i> 422
Part	Four Deal Goes Awry: Enforcement	425
	signment 21: Creditor Remedies	425
A.	Collecting Unsecured Debts  1. Lawsuits  2. Execution and Garnishment  Credit Bureau of Broken Bow, Inc. v. Moninger	426 426 427 428
В.	Collecting Secured Debts 1. Repossession 2. Foreclosure	430 430 432
	Protection from Debtor Suit  1. Holder in Due Course Doctrine  2. FTC Preservation Rule  Deutsche Bank National Trs. Co. v. Carmichael (In re Carmichael)  bblem Set 21	435 435 436 <i>437</i> 443
As	signment 22: Debtor Rights	445
А. В. С.	FTC Credit Practices Rule  F.T.C. v. Loanpointe  Exemptions  1. Property Exemptions  2. Wage Exemptions  J.M. v. Hobbs  Consumer Bankruptcy  Mitchell v. BankIllinois (In re Mitchell)  bblem Set 22	445 446 453 453 453 454 458 458 467
As	signment 23: Debt Collection Abuses	469
В.	Prohibited Acts Bingham v. Collection Bureau, Inc. Scope of FDCPA Dickman v. Kimball, Tirey & St. John, LLP State Debt Collection Laws Finley v. Dynamic Recovery Solutions LLC Debt Buyers	469 470 476 477 482 482 487
D. Е.	Debt Settlement or Consolidation	489
	oblem Set 23	490
Ass	signment 24: Public Enforcement	492
A.	Consumer Financial Protection Bureau v. ITT Educational	492
	Services, Inc.	493

kviii	Contents

	В.	State Attorneys General	505
	_	West Virginia v. CVS Pharmacy, Inc.	506
	Pro	blem Set 24	515
	Ass	ignment 25: Private Enforcement	518
	A.	0	518
		1. Actual Damages	519
		McGrady v. Nissan Motor Acceptance Corp	520
		2. Statutory Damages	524
	D	3. Other Relief	525
	В.	Litigation Barriers Sheffer v. Experian Information Solutions, Inc.	525 526
	C	Class Actions	534
		Non-Enforcement	535
		blem Set 25	536
	Ass	ignment 26: Alternative Dispute Resolution	538
		Arbitration and Its Premises	538
	В.		539
		1. Unconscionability and State Law	539
		AT&T Mobility LLC v. Concepcion	540
		2. Statutory or Other Prohibitions	554
	C.	Evaluating Arbitration	555
		1. Arguments for Arbitration	555
		2. Arguments Against Arbitration	556
	_	3. Barriers to Effective Evaluation	557
	Pro	blem Set 26	558
Pa	rt l	ive	
		umer Law Policymaking	561
	Ass	ignment 27: The Future of Consumer Law	561
	A.	Future Money	562
		1. Bitcoin	562
		2. Digital Fiat	563
		3. Consumer Protection Issues	563
	В.	Digital Media: Video Games	564
		1. Intangible Digital "Goods"	565
		2. Legal Framework	567
		3. Consumer Protection Issues	568
	C.	Socialization of Finance  1. Crowdfunding	569 570
		<ol> <li>Crowdfunding</li> <li>Peer to Peer Lending</li> </ol>	570
		3. Consumer Protection Issues	572
	D.		574
		blem Set 27	575
		ble of Cases	577
	Ind	lex	581

## **Preface**

Consumer law is incredibly complex, despite its applicability to millions of people engaged in everyday transactions. The complexity is reflected both in the law itself and in the challenges of trying to teach and learn consumer law. Consumer law has porous boundaries and comes from multiple sources rather than a single lawmaker or an integrated statutory code. Because consumer law is diffuse, many lawyers may practice in this area but not explicitly identify as "consumer lawyers." Anyone who represents individual people in civil cases, however, will find many client problems that arise from consumer transactions, and the demand from consumers for legal help greatly overwhelms the supply of knowledgeable lawyers. From the other side, nearly any business that sells goods or services to individuals will face consumer law issues with compliance and litigation.

Consumer law is rapidly growing in importance. A 2013 poll of professors found that consumer law ranked first as the area of law deserving more attention in the legal academy, beating out hot topics such as immigration law, energy law, and alternative dispute resolution. See Brian Leiter's Law School Reports blog, Apr. 18, 2013 at http://tinyurl.com/k3d7p4a. While law schools need to ramp up offerings in consumer law, the legal system and economy are more concerned with consumer issues now than at any time since the 1970s. The Dodd-Frank Wall Street Reform and Consumer Protection Act of 2010 contained sweeping law reforms and rearranged the very structure of consumer regulation. It created a Consumer Financial Protection Bureau to administer most federal consumer laws governing credit. This change reflects the unprecedented levels of household borrowing in the last twenty years and the importance of consumer spending to the overall economy. Because consumer law governs these purchases and loans, it has grown in size and complexity in tandem with its economic importance.

This book tackles the challenges of consumer law with a three-prong approach. First, it situates consumer law within the business law curriculum. At first this may seem counterintuitive, and of course, many who represent consumers do so in roles as government lawyers, legal services lawyers, or poverty lawyers. But consumer transactions, by definition, also involve businesses. Indeed, it is this consumer-to-business nature of the transaction that gives rise to the impetus for most consumer law. When businesses purchase property, goods, or services from each other (for example, a retailer that buys inventory from a wholesaler), consumer laws do not apply. Consumer law governs, however, when that retailer goes to sell the inventory in the form of goods on a shelf to a consumer. From this perspective, consumer law can be understood as the legal system's effort to address the disparities in sophistication and power that typically exist between consumers and businesses.

This book is built around the fact that consumer law is big business — both for lawyers and for the economy in general. The book reflects this "consumer

xx Preface

law as business law" philosophy in its content and its pedagogy. It spends time explaining the economics and business structure of many consumer transactions. It seeks to explore and explain the relevant market: How are these deals structured? Who makes money? Is the market competitive or constrained? How does information flow in the market? In its pedagogical approach, the book refrains from assuming the student shares the normative perspective of a consumer. The problems often ask students to advise businesses on the compliance issues or litigation risks created by consumer law, as well as advocate for a beleaguered consumer. This tactic recognizes that the world of consumer practice offers opportunities for lawyers to represent consumers (as government lawyers, policy advocates, and plaintiffs' attorneys) and to represent businesses (as in-house counsel, defense attorneys, and lobbyists).

Second, this book attempts to give consumer law a sharp theoretical framework by situating it at the intersection of contract and tort. Consumer law is more than a collection of laws with the word "consumer" in them. It is, as suggested above, the law's response to the failures of traditional law to achieve satisfactory outcomes in consumer-business transactions. The book repeatedly returns to the doctrines of fraud (from tort law) and unconscionability (from contract law) to see how the common law in these areas has been reshaped by statutes and regulations. These newer forms of law typically provide more protection for consumers and impose more duties on businesses than under the common law. Consumer law is an ideal place to expand on the first-year law school curriculum, adding skills in statutory analysis, administrative law, and policymaking to the student's toolkit. The book also attempts to show the artificiality of a public law/private law divide. It highlights the way in which private transactions have public effects, and conversely how public goals find their way into laws that inhibit or limit private deals

The third approach of the book to teaching consumer law is to be avowedly social scientific in its approach. In this regard, the book marshals the existing empirical research on topics related to consumer law such as financial literacy, household finance, and the legal profession. It also points out where important knowledge is missing and asks how such data could be obtained. Law is neither practiced nor made in a vacuum; the book reflects the belief that well-equipped lawyers are comfortable with a broad range of social science including psychology, marketing, sociology, and economics. The social science approach repeatedly turns to the gap between the law as written and the law as experienced, asking questions about the value of a law that remains unused or underenforced and the ways in which lawyers and courts struggle to engage successfully with consumers who lack legal knowledge. Of course, such problems plague many other areas of law but are predominant in consumer law.

These three characteristics of this book lead to a "casebook" that is quite far from the traditional law text. In fact, the book contains relatively few cases as compared to the amount of expository text. The text allows students to focus on the statutes and regulations that are the heart of modern consumer law. It also mirrors the reality that case law often does not exist on a particular point or is of little importance to a business lawyer or consumer lawyer trying to

Preface xxi

design a litigation strategy sharply constrained by reputational risks (business) or financial limits on affording counsel (consumer). The book's cases illustrate the factual context of the transactions as much as they teach the dispositive law. The book also uses rules, legislative history, research studies, websites, videos, and even things like cartoons and newspaper stories to teach consumer law. Part of the justification for this is that consumers themselves are likely to learn about their rights from these sources, rather than from published case law. The text tries to be explanatory in tone. As stated in this preface's first sentence, consumer law is hard. This book outlines the basic law and provides opportunities for using the core legal competencies of reading and analyzing law to see how the law applies in context.

The book is designed to be taught using a strong form of the problemmethod. Unlike the questions following cases in a traditional text, the problems are not to be skimmed and treated as rhetorical. The problems are to be read, analyzed, worked, and "solved" to the best of students' abilities before class. The problems take several typical forms. These include: 1) statute readers that highlight key points or ambiguities in the law itself; 2) transactional problems that pose questions of compliance, planning, and client counseling; 3) theoretical puzzlers that push on the persistent difficulties of consumer law as a legal subject; and 4) policy problems that require identifying the social, economic, and political issues at play in consumer lawmaking. The problems are fact-specific and contextual. This means that as in real life, some problems have clear answers and others are ambiguous. Some problems intentionally omit key facts because limited information is a real problem in lawyering. Other problems reflect that a half-victory or partial solution is often the only outcome, asking students to identify the limitations to a more comprehensive resolution.

This book's coverage is selective. It focuses on several major aspects of transactions: getting into a transaction, the substantive terms of the transactions, and enforcement if the transaction goes awry. It does not cover all the substantive goods, services, or property that consumers buy or all the types of financial products used in these transactions but instead selects certain products as emblematic of different approaches to consumer law. The intuition is that consumers and businesses face similar information and power disparities across transactions. Once students see how consumer law grapples with these issues in a particular context, they can identify similar problems and solutions in other areas. This approach has particular merit in consumer law, where the scams and frauds of today are regulated or litigated out of existence only to be replaced with new scams and frauds. Underneath activities ranging from advertising cold remedies to creating digital currency, the fundamental problems of consumer law remain. What is the appropriate amount of intervention in the market? How much should the law expect consumers to protect themselves? When is the burden on business so great that it creates economic hardships that outweigh the social benefits of regulations?

This book is organized into five major parts. It opens by asking some basic questions about the nature of consumer law. This part provides an opportunity to tackle the boundary problem of consumer law and to introduce students to the multiple origins of consumer law. The book gives heavy weight to federal consumer law but covers state law as applicable, doing so by focusing

xxii Preface

on a particular jurisdiction to illustrate a typical approach. Part 2 focuses on the initial contact between the consumer and business; it addresses issues related to advertising, marketing, and access to credit. Part 3 considers the terms of a consumer-business transaction in two ways. It begins with a study of substantive limits on the sale of products and the extension of credit, looking at issues like warranties, disclosure, and credit cost. Then, it looks in depth with one or more assignments on each of several major consumer products: homes, automobiles, credit cards, student loans, etc. Part 4 of the book studies the rights and remedies of creditors and debtors if the transaction does not go as planned. It considers how the law balances enforcement of the contracted-for bargain against protection of consumers. It also distinguishes between the enforcement mechanisms used in consumer law such as private litigation, public action, and alternate dispute methods. The final section, Part 5, addresses consumer law policymaking by studying emerging topics for consumer law.

Consumer law is sometimes derided as the law of small people and small problems. In my view, this characterization is inaccurate. Consumers may be "small" in their individual contexts, but their force in the economy and in society is formidable. Being a consumer is one of the key ways that people engage in the world. The ways in which the law allows consumers and business to transact reflect core values about capitalism and democracy. Consumer law is a fertile ground for examining normative principles about the role of law in an economy and a society. I have found studying and shaping consumer law to have many rewards and challenges. I hope this book inspires you to identify and engage as a citizen and lawyer with consumer law issues. Consumers and businesses will benefit from a new generation of those people passionate about consumer law.

January 2016 Irvine, California

KATHERINE PORTER